

**Evaluation Report for Hiring of Consultancy Services for the Project**  
**“Strengthening of The Women University Multan (Phase-II)”**  
**(Quality and Cost Based Method)**

- i) Tender for hiring of consultancy firms was published in newspapers on 13.10.2021 vide IPL No. 10465 and uploaded on the PPRA website on the same date.
- ii) The detail of the No. of tenders sold on the request of the bidders and the No. of tenders received are given below:

Procurement Name	No. Tenders Sold	No. of Tenders Received
Request for Proposal Hiring of Consultancy Services for the project “Strengthening of The Women University Multan (Phase-II)”	07	06 received against sold tenders & 01 received (not sold) by M/S New Vision on the day of tender opening which was not entertained and kept unopened.

- iii) The closing date of tender documents receipt was 02.11.2021 till 11:00am. The opening date of the Tender document was 02.11.2021 at 12:00PM. Procuring Agency adopted Single Stage Two Envelope bidding procedure as per Rule No.38(2)(a) of PPR-2014.
- iv) The Technical bids of the following bidders were opened on 02.11.2021 at 12:00pm as per PPR Rule 30:

Procurement Name	Name of Bidder
Request for Proposal Hiring of Consultancy Services for the project “Strengthening of The Women University Multan (Phase-II)”	1) Velosi Integrity & Safety Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd, Lahore 2) G3 Engineering Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd, Lahore 3) Asian Consulting Engineers, Lahore 4) MAC Engineering Services, Peshawar 5) AZ Engineering Associates, Lahore 6) MAK Engineering Services, Peshawar

- v) Bids were evaluated in accordance with the Technical Evaluation criteria and other terms and conditions set forth in the bidding documents as per PPR Rules 32. The detail of qualified and disqualified bidders was uploaded on the website of the University on 29.11.2021. The detail of qualified and disqualified bidders is given below:

Qualified Bidders	Disqualified Bidder	Reason for Disqualification/ Non-Responsive
1) Velosi Integrity & Safety Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd, Lahore 2) G3 Engineering Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd, Lahore 3) Asian Consulting Engineers, Lahore 4) AZ Engineering Associates, Lahore 5) MAK Engineering Services, Peshawar	MAC Engineering Services, Peshawar	Firm could not secure required marks to qualify i.e 65% as well as non-provision of registration with Registrar of Firms/SECP which is violation of clause 33.3 (i) of I.T.C in Bidding Document.

- vi) The bidders were informed through letter dated 02-12-2021 about Technical Evaluation (qualified/disqualified) which was also uploaded on university website and were also invited to participate in Financial Opening of the bids of Technically Qualified Consultants/Firms on 14-12-2021. Summary of Technical Evaluation (which was approved by CSC in its meeting held on 29.11.2021) is given below:

Name of Firm	MAC Engg.	MAK Engg. (JV) WADAAN	G-3 Engg.	VELOSI	AZ Engg. (JV) Tech Zone	Asian
<b>Experience</b>	25	40	40	30	40	35
<b>Project Team</b>	23	25	36	30	32	32
<b>Financial Strength</b>	2	2	10	10	10	10
<b>Approach &amp; Method.</b>	5	7	9	7	9	8
<b>Total (out Of 100)</b>	55	74	95	77	91	85
<b>Total (out Of 80)</b>	Disqualified (in Score & Mandatory Doc)	59.2	76	61.6	72.8	68

*Handwritten signature and date*  
24-12-21

- vii) Financial Bids of Technically Qualified Firms (except MAC Engineering Services) were opened by the Consultant Selection Committee on 14-12-2021 in the presence of the bidder's representatives as per provision of PPR Rules 30(2) and quoted bid prices by Consultants/Firms were announced.
- viii) Following is the Financial Summary of Bids (QCBS Method) based on the rates without PST (Bids are received with PST which will be applicable as per Govt. rates):

Name of Firm	MAK Engg Services (JV) WADAAN Consultants	G-3 Engineering Consultants (Pvt) Ltd	VELOSI Integrity & Safety Pakistan (Pvt) Ltd	AZ Engg Associates (JV) Tech Zone Consultant	Asian Consulting Engineers (Pvt) Ltd
Financial Bid (without Punjab Sales Tax) (Rs)	18,799,652	19,901,774	30,991,623	21,233,226	30,276,170
Punjab Sales Tax @ 16% (Rs.)	3,007,945	3,184,284	4,958,660	3,397,317	4,844,188
Financial Bid (including all Taxes) (Rs.)	21,807,597	23,086,058	35,950,283	24,630,543	35,120,358
Financial Score (out of 100)	100	94.46	60.66	88.54	62.09
Financial Score (out of 20)	20	18.89	12.13	17.71	12.42

- ix) Following is the Overall Evaluation Result of Bids (QCBS Method):

Technical Score (out of 80)	59.2	76	61.6	72.8	68
Financial Score (out of 20)	20	18.89	12.13	17.71	12.42
Total Score (QCBS)	79.2	94.89	73.73	90.51	80.42
Position	4 <sup>th</sup>	1 <sup>st</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup>	2 <sup>nd</sup>	3 <sup>rd</sup>

- x) The overall evaluation result of the bids is on the basis of Quality and Cost based Selection method (QCBS) and the work will be awarded to G-3 Engineering Consultants (Pvt) Ltd being highest ranked bidder in pursuance of PPRA Rules because the said Consultant Firm has submitted financial proposal within the approved cost of Rs.25.261 Million.

All the members of Committee showed entire satisfaction and decided that the report will be uploaded on PPRA as well as University web site for Ten days as per Clause 67(2) of PPRA Rules 2014, all the Bidders will be informed through letters.

Engr. Asad Ali Bhutta  
Project Director/Secretary  
Consultant Selection Committee

*Asad*  
24/12/2021

*AS*  
24/12/2021

CC to:

- Worthy Vice Chancellor/Chairperson Consultant Selection Committee
- Members of Consultant Selection Committee
- Resident Auditor, The Women University Multan
- University Engineer, The Women University Multan